

Rechtsgeschichte Legal History

www.rg.mpg.de

<http://www.rg-rechtsgeschichte.de/rg27>
Zitiervorschlag: Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History Rg 27 (2019)
<http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg27/280-283>

Rg **27** 2019 280 – 283

José Luis Egío García *

Towards a New Narrative of Natural Law Thinking in Early Modern Scholasticism

* Max-Planck-Institut für europäische Rechtsgeschichte, Frankfurt am Main / Goethe-Universität Frankfurt am Main / Akademie der Wissenschaften und der Literatur Mainz, egio@rg.mpg.de

Dieser Beitrag steht unter einer Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License



Rechtsgeschichte Legal History

www.rg.mpg.de

<http://www.rg-rechtsgeschichte.de/rg27>

Zitiervorschlag: Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History Rg 27 (2019)

<http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg27/009-019>

Rg **27** 2019 9 – 19

Inhalt

Dieser Beitrag steht unter einer Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License



António Manuel Hespanha †	22	Thirty Years of Studies on Prosopography of Portuguese Early Modern Jurists
Jean-Louis Halpérin	51	A German Linkage Between Criminal Law and Law of Nations as Academic Disciplines

Fokus focus

Tridentine Marriage

Benedetta Albani	66	Global Perspectives on Tridentine Marriage. An Introduction
David L. d'Avray, Werner Menski	71	Authenticating Marriage: The Decree <i>Tametsi</i> in a Comparative Global Perspective
Ana de Zaballa Beascochea	90	Indian Marriage Before and After the Council of Trent: From pre-Hispanic Marriage to Christian Marriage in New Spain
Pilar Latasa	105	Tridentine Marriage Ritual in Sixteenth- to Eighteenth-century Peru: From Global Procedures to American Idiosyncrasies
Robert C. Schwaller	123	The Spiritual Conquest of Marriage: How the Holy Office and Council of Trent Attempted to Reform the Laity of New Spain
María Elena Imolesi	131	Doing the Same But With Different Arguments: Matrimonial Dispensations in the Indigenous and Spanish Population of Colonial Charcas
Hélène Vu Thanh	143	Introducing Tridentine Marriage: The Jesuits' Strategy in Japan (Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries)
Marya Svetlana T. Camacho	153	Marriage in the Philippines After the Council of Trent (Seventeenth to Eighteenth Centuries)
Cecilia Cristellon	163	The Roman Congregations and the Application of the <i>Tametsi</i> as an Instrument of Their Policies Towards Mixed Marriages in Europe (1563–1798)

Thomas Duve, Fupeng Li	174	Translating Weimar. Introductory Remarks
Leticia Vita	176	Weimar in Argentina: a Transnational Analysis of the 1949 Constitutional Reform
Carlos M. Herrera	184	Weimar, the South American Way
Xin Nie	195	The Chinese Constitutional Social Welfare Articles Before 1949 – Comparison With the Weimar Constitution
Fupeng Li	207	Becoming Policy. Cultural Translation of the Weimar Constitution in China (1919–1949)
Donal K. Coffey	222	The Influence of the Weimar Constitution on the Common Law World

Stefan Vogenauer	232	Introduction: Two <i>Oxford Handbooks</i> on the History of Law
Caspar Ehlers	237	Multiple Universen der Rechtsgeschichte
Zeynep Yazici Caglar	241	Comparative Legal History – But How?
Anselm Küsters, Laura Volkind, Andreas Wagner	244	Digital Humanities and the State of Legal History. A Text Mining Perspective
Luisa Stella de Oliveira Coutinho Silva	260	Sexy Legal History: Mapping Sexualities in a Handbook
Victoria Barnes, Sean Bottomley, Anselm Küsters	265	Economic History as Legal History
Mariana Dias Paes	271	What About African Legal History?
Christoph H.F. Meyer	276	Zweimal mittelalterliches Kirchenrecht
José Luis Egío García	280	Towards a New Narrative of Natural Law Thinking in Early Modern Scholasticism
Aleksi Ollikainen-Read	284	Paradigm Choices in Anglo-American Law of Obligations
Peter Collin	286	How to Describe the Law of the Welfare State?
Gerd Bender	288	Im Labyrinth
Jan-Henrik Meyer	291	A Plea for More Historical Awareness in Environmental Law

Guido Pfeifer	296	(No) Hard Feelings! Philipp Ruch, »Ehre und Rache«
Karla Escobar	297	Agresivamente histórico y global John Brooke et al. (eds.), State Formations
Georg May	300	Kanonistik im Spiegel von Kanonisten Philipp Thull (Hg.), 60 Porträts aus dem Kirchenrecht
Elisabetta Fiocchi Malaspina	305	Forme di proprietà nel tempo e nello spazio Georgy Kantor, Tom Lambert, Hannah Skoda (eds.), Legalism: Property and Ownership
Daniel S. Allemann	308	Eine Genealogie spanischen Rechtsdenkens Rafael Domingo, Javier Martínez-Torrón (Hg.), Great Christian Jurists in Spanish History
Manuela Bragagnolo	310	Un atto culturale Hugo Beuvant et al. (dir.), Les traductions du discours juridique
Roland Scheel	312	Vom langsamen Werden dänischer Königsmacht Nils Hybel, The Nature of Kingship c. 800–1300
Philipp N. Spahn	315	Tripartite Legal Knowledge Stephan Dusil, Wissensordnungen des Rechts
Caspar Ehlers	317	Kanonisches Recht nach dem Investiturstreit Melodie H. Eichbauer, Danica Summerlin (Hg.), The Use of Canon Law in Ecclesiastical Administration, 1000–1234
Caspar Ehlers	319	Wer spiegelt wen? Lucas Wüsthof, Schwabenspiegel und Augsburger Stadtrecht
Caspar Ehlers	320	Flexible Prediger Cornelia Linde (Hg.), Making and Breaking the Rules
Victoria Barnes	322	Big Business Dave De ruysscher, Albrecht Cordes et al. (eds.), The Company in Law and Practice

Albrecht Cordes	324	Zünfte und Wirtschaftswachstum Sheilagh Ogilvie, <i>The European Guilds. An Economic Analysis</i>
Andrzej Gulczyński	327	Ein Kompendium in Wort und Bild Heiner Lück, <i>Der Sachsenspiegel</i>
Thomas Simon	329	Ohne Gleichen: württembergische »Ehrbarkeit« Nina Kühnle, <i>Wir, Vogt, Richter und Gemeinde</i>
Bernd Kannowski	332	<i>Vae cupidae legum iuventuti</i> – jugendgefährdendes Schrifttum! Gabriele von Olberg-Haverkate, <i>Die Textsorte Rechtsbücher</i>
Stéphane Péquignot	336	Pour une relecture des traités diplomatiques de la fin du Moyen Âge Gesa Wilangowski, <i>Frieden schreiben im Spätmittelalter</i>
Daniel S. Allemann	338	Re-reading Vitoria Francisco de Vitoria, <i>Relecciones jurídicas y teológicas</i>
Pamela Alejandra Cacciavillani	341	La importancia de no ser llamados <i>Indigenous Peoples</i> Irene Watson (ed.), <i>Indigenous Peoples as Subjects of International Law</i>
Petr Kreuz	342	Aus der polnischen Kriminalitätsforschung Pawel Klint, Daniel Wojtucki (Hg.), <i>Przestępczość kryminalna w Europie Środkowej i Wschodniej</i>
Otto Danwerth	345	Rebels With a Cause in Spanish America Gregorio Salinero, <i>Hombres de mala corte</i>
Luisa Stella de Oliveira Coutinho Silva	349	Vozes femininas em espaços imperiais Nora E. Jaffary, Jane E. Mangan, <i>Women in Colonial Latin America, 1526 to 1806</i>
Heinz Mohnhaupt	351	»Wer Hoheitsrechte hat, visitiert« Anette Baumann, <i>Visitationen am Reichskammergericht</i>

Claudia Curcuruto	353	Rechtseinheit durch Reichsgerichte Josef Bongartz et al. (Hg.), Was das Reich zusammenhielt
Osvaldo Rodolfo Moutin	355	Barely Known Old Legal Texts Come to Light Juan Fernando Cobo Betancourt, Natalie Cobo (eds.), La legislación de la arquidiócesis de Santafé
Manuel Bastías Saavedra	357	Property and the Early Modern Condition Alan Greer, Property and Dispossession
Thomas Duve	359	Verstanden? Brian P. Owensby, Richard J. Ross (Hg.), Justice in a New World
Michele Graziadei	362	Not on the Other Side of the Channel! Martin Flohr, Rechtsdogmatik in England
Rafael Diego-Fernández Sotelo	365	El concepto de <i>formación protoestatal</i> en Hispanoamérica Horst Pietschmann, Acomodos políticos, mentalidades y vías de cambio
Tilman Reppen	368	Why Obey? Stefan Schweighöfer, Die Begründung der normativen Kraft von Gesetzen bei Francisco Suárez
Francesco Giuliani	370	A Global Perspective on <i>De Propaganda Fide</i> Giovanni Pizzorusso, Governare le missioni, conoscere il mondo nel XVII secolo
Manuela Bragagnolo	372	Probabilmente moralmente legittime Stefania Tutino, Uncertainty in Post-Reformation Catholicism
Albrecht Cordes	375	CHILE und die Geschichte des Versicherungsrechts Phillip Hellwege (Hg.), A Comparative History of Insurance Law in Europe ders., The Past, Present, and Future of Tontines ders., A History of Tontines in Germany
Gustavo César Machado Cabral	378	Clerical Misconduct in Colonial Brazil Pollyanna Gouveia Mendonça Muniz, Réus de Batina

Filippo Ranieri	380	Englische Verfassung <i>à la française</i> Tanguy Pasquiel-Briand, La réception de la Constitution anglaise au XIX ^e siècle
Stefan Kroll	384	Zerbrochen am Kontext Jennifer Pitts, Boundaries of the International
Justine Keli Collins	386	To be or not to be a True Born Englishmen Dana Y. Rabin, Britain and its Internal Others
Heinz Mohnhaupt	387	»Am Ende stritt man um Akten« Alexander Denzler, Über den Schriftalltag im 18. Jahrhundert
Carlos Petit	390	Luces y sombras sobre la <i>Sombra de Vitoria</i> Ignacio de la Rasilla del Moral, In the Shadow of Vitoria
Mariana Dias Paes	392	Novas perspectivas para uma História Atlântica do Direito Mariana Pinho Candido, Fronteiras da escravidão Cristina Nogueira da Silva, A construção jurídica dos territórios ultramarinos portugueses Flávia Maria de Carvalho, Sobas e os homens do rei
Mathias Reimann	397	How the United States Failed to Establish a »Government of Laws« James R. Maxeiner, Failures of American Methods of Lawmaking
Paolo Becchi	401	Was ist uns Thibaut? Christian Hattenhauer et al. (Hg.), A.F.J. Thibaut (1772–1840). Bürger und Gelehrter
Adriane Sanctis de Brito	404	In the Name of Civilisation Michel Erpelding, Le droit international anti-esclavagiste des »nations civilisées«
Matthias Schwaibold	406	Vorgebliche Antworten auf eine falsche Frage Daniel Arne Wyss, Wie viel Bluntschli steckt in Huber?
Maddalena Burelli	410	Una dichiarazione di indipendenza dimenticata Lucrecia Enríquez, Historia, memoria y olvido del 12 de febrero de 1818

Raquel R. Sirotti	412	Built to Colonize Dior Konaté, Prison Architecture and Punishment in Colonial Senegal
Bruno Lima	414	Liberated Africans With Rights? Beatriz Mamigonian, Africanos livres: a abolição do tráfico de escravos no Brasil
Christoph Resch	416	Vertragsgeschichte mit Charles Dickens Anat Rosenberg, Liberalizing Contracts. Nineteenth Century Promises
Michael Stolleis	418	»Im Reiche und in den Ländern müssen nach Maßgabe der Gesetze Verwaltungsgerichte ... bestehen« (Art. 107 Weimarer Reichsverfassung) Karl-Peter Sommermann, Bert Schaffarzik (Hg.), Handbuch der Geschichte der Verwaltungsgerichtsbarkeit
Leticia Vita	420	Volver a los clásicos, volver a Sinzheimer Otto Ernst Kempfen, Hugo Sinzheimer
Simon Groth	424	Wie wir wurden, wer wir waren Johannes Liebrecht, Die junge Rechtsgeschichte
Milan Kuhli	426	Diskursgeschichte des Völkerstrafrechts Annette Weinke, Gewalt, Geschichte, Gerechtigkeit
Michael Stolleis	429	Der Strom kommt aus der Steckdose Dirk van Laak, Alles im Fluss. Die Lebensadern unserer Gesellschaft
Warren Swain	432	»The narrow ways of English folk« Mark Lunney, A History of Australian Tort Law 1901–1945
Valeria Vegh Weis	434	»Haz lo que digo y no lo que hago« Daniel Brückenhaus, Policing Transnational Protest
Philipp Siegert	436	Öffentliches Recht in Frankreich, 1914–1918 Elina Lemaire (Hg.), La Grande Guerre et le droit public Comité d'Histoire du Conseil d'État (Hg.), Le Conseil d'État et la Grande Guerre

- Anna Clara Lehmann Martins** 439 A »diabolical Constitution« in Mexico
Carmen-José Alejos Grau, Una historia olvidada e inolvidable
- Rahela Khorakiwala** 441 The Historicity of Law in India
Aparna Balachandran, Bhavani Rashmi Pant (eds.), Iterations of Law: Legal Histories from India
- Marcelo Neves** 443 Constituição de Weimar, presente!
Udo Di Fabio, Die Weimarer Verfassung
Horst Dreier, Christian Waldhoff (orgs.), Das Wagnis der Demokratie
- Stefan Kroll** 446 Does the Present Matter?
Marcus M. Payk, Frieden durch Recht?
- Hendrik Simon** 448 Das Alte in der neuen Ordnung
Oona A. Hathaway, Scott J. Shapiro, The Internationalists
- Jasper Kunstreich** 451 Against Theory?
Felix Lange, Praxisorientierung und Gemeinschaftskonzeption: Hermann Mosler
- Thomas Clausen** 453 From Prussia to the People's Court
Tilman Pünder, In den Fängen des NS-Staates

Anette Baumann 458 Visuelle Evidenz.
Beobachtungen zu Inaugenscheinnahmen und
Augenscheinkarten am Reichskammergericht
(1495–1806)

Abbildungen 462 illustrations

Abstracts 465 abstracts

Autoren 472 contributors

José Luis Egío García

Towards a New Narrative of Natural Law Thinking in Early Modern Scholasticism

The presence of moral theology and scholasticism in the recently published *Oxford Handbook of Legal History* and *Oxford Handbook of European Legal History* is very limited. The first volume aims to be iconoclastic. It explicitly does not seek to provide a kind of global historical account but instead presents some of the innovative methodological perspectives guiding current legal historical research. Thomas Duve, writing about the contribution of the School of Salamanca to the theorization of a certain framework of »indigenous rights« during the period of colonial domination, is thus the only contributor to this volume who mentions moral theology. In the *Handbook of European Legal History*, there are two articles on important scholastic contributions to legal history that also deal with the influence of Salamanca and related scholastic authors to equally wide fields of legal thinking. Wim Decock discusses authors of the second scholasticism in the context of the law of property and obligations (611–632), and David Ibbetson writes on natural law (566–582). In the following, I will focus on Ibbetson's chapter, which only partially matches the ambitious intended aims of the volume editors (Pihlajamäki, Dubber, Godfrey): to »chart the landscape of contemporary research« and to show the global impact that European legal systems had »from the fifteenth century onwards«.

David Ibbetson is Professor of Civil Law at the University of Cambridge and has written authoritative books and articles in the field of legal history covering a wide chronological range.¹ In this chapter, he addresses a topic in which the significance of second scholasticism – Catholic and Protestant – absolutely cannot be silenced or dimin-

ished: the re-emergence of the concept of natural law in the mid-16th century and the importance that this concept – and the argumentation dependent on it – gained in legal discourses and practices during the early modern period.

After a very brief introduction – a mere eight lines long – summarizing the ancient roots and early modern doctrinal developments he will cover in his *exposé*, Ibbetson presents the antecedents of the modern idea of natural law that were formulated by Aristotle and Cicero (Section I, 1). Natural law did not have »any jurisprudential weight« either in Republican or in Imperial Rome, as the function of the principles that some philosophical schools considered to be part of it was always unclear (Section I, 2). Ibbetson therefore quickly abandons the Greek and Roman context and focuses on the way in which Aquinas (Section I, 3) and particularly certain Spanish Renaissance Thomists (Domingo de Soto and Luis de Molina, Section I, 4) assigned to natural law the function of a normative mirror against which human/positive laws should be compared in order to avoid excessive and unjustified distortions. After this brief review of the above-mentioned antecedents, the writings of Grotius (Section II, 1), Pufendorf, and other central figures (Section II, 2) of the natural law school of thought in central and northern Europe are examined as the main exponents of the idea of natural law's validity not depending on divine authority (with the famous Grotian sentence *Etsi Deus non daretur*). These thinkers sought to identify its elusive first principles in order to deduce from these the main substantial contents of *ius gentium* and positive law. Ibbetson closes his examination of the abovementioned keystones of

1 His publications deal with such diverse topics as the Roman law tradition in the Early Middle Ages and legal education in contemporary England. See e. g. DAVID IBBETSON, *A Historical Introduction to the Law of Obligations*, Oxford 1999, and IDEM, *European Legal Development: The Case of Tort*, Cambridge 2012.

early modern juridical thinking by presenting the problems raised by a natural law method constructed as an imitation of the *mos geometricum* in vogue in metaphysics and natural philosophy at the time: irreconcilable conflicts between first principles of natural law, lack of evidence of certain deductions and superficial objectivity of the great systems constructed by modern jurists, giants with feet of clay.

The historical account of books and writers of Sections I and II is followed in Section III by a thematic discussion of the parallel theorization of the *ius gentium* in the early modern period, which has usually been represented as having been dependent on the definition and hierarchization of the *ius naturale*. Even in this thematic section, however, Ibbetson remains anchored to the same chronological and geographical schema he uses to construct his whole article, travelling from 16th-century Spain to the 17th-century Netherlands and Enlightenment Germany. To the above-mentioned names he adds references to the works of Rachel, Textor, and Wolff.

In Section IV, Ibbetson shows the affinities between the thinking of Grotius or Wolff and the Enlightenment movement. Both gave a central role to reason and were optimistic regarding the possibility of human beings gaining objective knowledge from nature, whether from physical realities or from moral and legal principles. In this rationalistic commitment, Ibbetson sees the intellectual foundation of the evolution from the mere »collections of the law in force« of the 17th century to the 18th century's systematic legal codifications »in accordance with reason«. Ibbetson touches on codes and codification projects coming from different German states, the Habsburg monarchy, Russia, and France. In perhaps the best section of his contribution, Ibbetson analyses why only some of these codes – for example, the Napoleonic *Code Civil* of 1804 – can be considered true natural law codifications. Many others, while containing indirect references to the work of the main natural law jurists, did not abandon Roman Law as a necessary mediation between the abstract principles of natural law and positive written law.

In a fifth section, Ibbetson deals with the role of natural law thinking in England. He deliberately discusses this separately from continental Europe because the English system, in contrast to the continental ones, was never structured around Roman law, and also knew no codification move-

ment similar to the projects undertaken in France, Spain, or the German states. As in previous sections, Ibbetson focuses on a few milestones of juridical thinking to explain the particular evolution of the debates on natural law in the English realm. Starting with Edward Coke's famous *Institutes of the Laws of England* (1628), Ibbetson reviews the scholarly contributions of figures such as Selden, Hobbes, Locke, or Hale, in which he detects a certain Grotian influence. The final paragraphs follow the echo of Pufendorf's *De Iure Naturae et Gentium* in the works of 18th-century English writers of juridical treatises, specifically Ballow, Pothier, Buller, and Blackstone. Ibbetson here mentions natural law thinkers' influence on English legal doctrines related to contracts, negligence, the first laws concerning copyright, and even the increasing trend to present and explain technical customary laws within rational and systematic frameworks.

To begin with the critical evaluation of Ibbetson's contribution, we can say that all the elements he covers are *sine qua non* – their absence would be hard to explain in a survey of natural law thinking within the historiographical genre of a handbook, which imposes significant thematic and space limitations. In the face of these external constraints, the author seems to have opted for a deliberately classical approach that appears to stand in contrast to both *Handbooks'* avowed emphasis on groundbreaking and innovative approaches.

Different elements could perhaps have been mentioned in passing in order to reinforce the link between the chapter's contents and the editors' motivations. For example, more attention could have been paid to the debates on natural law in geographical regions located at the periphery of the already well-studied continental axis, such as in Scandinavia or Southern and Eastern Europe.

The article does not discuss the current state of research, but a brief survey of the existing – and abundant – literature on natural law in the early modern period would have been useful in order to underline the methodological challenges and to identify the main gaps with which contemporary researchers are dealing, or will have to deal with, in the following years.

Another *vacuum* in Ibbetson's account on the development of natural law in early modern juridical thinking is the absence of an explanatory hypothesis allowing the reader to understand why natural law – defined and partially explored,

as Ibbetson mentions, by ancient and medieval philosophers and theologians but not by their contemporaneous jurists – attained an importance in the early modern period that it had never seen before and became a decisive juridical authoritative referent.

The link between the impressive succession of theoretical developments in the field of natural law in early modern thinking and the European Reformation could have served as such a general explanatory hypothesis. As other scholars dealing with this issue have shown,² the »need for finding new rationales for obligating men« in a Europe split by the Reformation could explain why the 1530s and the 1540s were so decisive for both the consolidation of the Protestant movement and the reemergence of natural law. These two decades were precisely the period in which first systematizations and hierarchizations of natural law – within the overarching notion of *ius* – were elaborated by the first generation of members of the so-called School of Salamanca and contemporary Protestant theologians and jurists.

Nevertheless, Ibbetson does not take into account one of the two main roots of early modern natural law thinking, the Protestant one. Protestant reflection on natural law began long before Grotius' *De Jure Belli ac Pacis* with key figures such as Melancthon and Oldendorp.³ On the Catholic side, Ibbetson takes Soto alone as »the most important« representative of the way in which the *salmantinos* emphasized natural law as the guiding framework against which to evaluate positive law and to correct any excessive deviations from that framework. Why Soto deserves to be mentioned in this historical and theoretical account but not jurists such as Azpilcueta, Covarrubias, Castro, or Vázquez de Menchaca (all of whom worked under the same normative paradigm and should be considered as of equal importance regarding this issue) is not explained. A propensity to make crucial and problematic choices without explaining the intel-

lectual motivations behind them is, in fact, a recurring problem throughout the text. Even within the constraints of the handbook genre, the omissions could at least have been signaled in order to avoid the creation of a monolithic narrative.

In addition to the important intra-European and intra-Christian historical factors mentioned above, events and processes taking place outside Europe, in the lands of »infidels«, strongly influenced European ideas on natural law. A first challenge concerned the need to legitimize the Spanish presence in the Americas by appealing to non-confessional, supra-positive norms that could be taken as solid foundational »titles« by contemporary European powers. I refer to the urgent and permanent need to discredit the pretensions of those who did not accept papal bulls and donations as legitimizing instruments.

The second challenge to early modern natural law thinkers resulting from the discovery of the »New World« was independent of any kind of European rivalries around the proper sources of law and legitimacy. The encounter with the unexpected and radical otherness of the American natives played a crucial role in the pioneering developments of natural legal thinking. It concerned the unparalleled and problematic *convivencia* of Spaniards with a great number of heterogeneous pagan peoples, whose unusual and almost »fantastical« customs the Christian invaders began, little by little, to notice and understand. The respect due to a myriad of popular practices, rites, and customary ways of ruling, obeying, taxation, etc. complicated the already complex multinormative legal system brought to America by the Spaniards even more.

Vitoria, Soto and other prominent members of the School of Salamanca recognized that Christians could not ask American »infidels« to obey divine law or convert them by force. They also took into account that Christianity was lacking a

2 Among the most recent accounts, I consider von Friedeburg's particularly valuable. See ROBERT VON FRIEDEBURG, *The Rise of Natural Law in the Early Modern Period*, in: ULRICH LEHNER et al. (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Early Modern Theology, 1600–1800*, Oxford 2016, 625–641.

3 ANTTI RAUNIO, *Natural Law in the Lutheran Tradition*, in: NORMAN DOE (ed.), *Christianity and Natural Law*, Cambridge 2017, 77–97; MARY A. PLAATJES VAN HUFFEL, *Natural Law in the Reformed Tradition*, in: *ibid.*, 121–139.

common answer to the question of what should be considered as the real contents of this elusive divine law. Natural law therefore from the very beginning of the colonization process acted as a decisive authoritative point of reference. This is true even for the – until now rather understudied – period before Vitoria.⁴ By the middle of the 16th century, natural law had become such an important authoritative referent that, in order to facilitate the *convivencia* with pagans and neophytes, many theologians and jurists⁵ proposed a temporary tolerance of jurisdictional, tributary or matrimonial native customs that – even if far away from the prescriptions of Christian divine law – were not flagrant violations of the first principles of natural law. Even if it might seem paradoxical at first sight, the encounters with the American »other« and the missionary and civilizational campaigns to which many of the Iberian scholastic thinkers contributed stimulated the secularization of natural law. Not only in Ibbetson's text, but in many handbooks and encyclopedic accounts, too,⁶ such a complex and multistage process tends to be represented as the result of Grotius' speculative genius.

Moving on to other issues, a certain attention to neglected legal spheres, such as public law or canon law, could have also been useful to avoid the relative isolation in which the English debates on natural law are presented in Section V. Within this sphere, already by the mid-16th century there were substantial discussions on the natural law of self-defense in almost all of the treatises justifying

resistance against illegitimate royal provisions and officers (Hobbes' re-theorization of this alleged right of self-defense in fact presupposes an attack on these kinds of writings). Arguments coming from natural law could act also as connecting bridges between England and the Continent regarding many other juridical issues. In canon law thinking there were strong ties, e.g. between the doctrines on marriage and dispensation elaborated by Cardinal John Fisher and the first generation of Salamanca's masters (Vitoria, Soto, Vera Cruz, ...), an issue in which natural law played a crucial role.

A last critical remark concerns the fact that the practical dimension of the topic of natural law remains in an almost total obscurity within this contribution, as it does in many other approaches coming from the field of the history of ideas.⁷ I am referring specifically to the increasing presence of arguments coming from different natural law theories in the European courts of the early modern period, a subject recently studied by Richard Helmholz in his challenging *Natural Law in Court. A History of Legal Theory in Practice* (Cambridge 2015). New scholarly perspectives on the field of natural law seem to come from a new wave of mixed theoretical-empirical studies on natural law as a »living law« in the early modern period. Unfortunately, these are missing from Ibbetson's contribution to the *Oxford Handbook of European Legal History*.



4 For the case of the debates taking place at the Junta de Burgos of 1512 and the importance given to natural law, see JOSÉ LUIS EGÍO GARCÍA, Matías de Paz and the Introduction of Thomism in the *Asuntos de Indias*: A Conceptual Revolution, in: *Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History* 26 (2018) 236–263, online: <http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg26/236-262>; CHRISTIANE BIRR, *Dominium* in the Indies. Juan López de Palacios Rubios' *Libellus de insulis oceanis quas vulgus indias appellat* (1512–1516), in: *Rechtsgeschichte – Legal History* 26 (2018) 264–283, online: <http://dx.doi.org/10.12946/rg26/264-283>.

5 A paradigmatic case would be that of Alonso de la Vera Cruz, who was ac-

tive in the Viceroyalty of New Spain. See VIRGINIA ASPE ARMELLA, Integración cultural y ley natural en el *Speculum Coniugiorum* de Alonso de la Veracruz, in: *Revista Estudios* 32 (2016) 377–402; ANASTASÍA ASSIMAKÓPULOS, SEBASTIÁN CONTRERAS, Matrimonio y derecho natural en Alonso de Veracruz (1507–1584), in: *Revista de Estudios Histórico-Jurídicos* 39 (2017) 173–193.

6 HANS SCHLOSSER, *Neuere Europäische Rechtsgeschichte*, 3rd ed., Munich 2017.

7 ANNABEL BRETT, *Nature and the Limits of the City in Early Modern Natural Law*, Princeton 2011; ANNABEL BRETT, *Liberty, Right and Nature: Individual Rights in Later*

Scholastic Thought, Cambridge 1997; MERIO SCATTOLA, *Before and After Natural Law. Models of Natural Law in Ancient and Modern Times*, in: TIM J. HOCHSTRASSER, PETER SCHRÖDER (eds.), *Early Modern Natural Law Theories. Contexts and Strategies in the Early Enlightenment*, Dordrecht 2003, 1–30; RICHARD TUCK, *Natural Rights Theories: Their Origin and Development*, Cambridge 1979; ALESSANDRO PASSERIN D'ENTRÈVES, *Natural law: an introduction to legal philosophy*, London 1970.